

COMPARISON STATEMENT OF EXECUTIVES PROMOTION POLICY AS RECOMMENDED BY BSNL BOARD, Shri BHAVE COMMITTEE AND SECRETARY, DOT

Sl. No.	Recommendations of the High Level Committee and approved by BSNL Board (with modifications as indicated with the proposal)	Recommendations of the Shri Bhave Committee	Policy as approved by Secretary, DoT
1.	The first upgradation of IDA scale of individual Executive will be due for consideration on completion of 4 (four) years of service in the current IDA scale subject to the condition that the Executive's basic pay in the current IDA scale has crossed /touched the lowest of the higher IDA scale for which his/her upgradation is to be considered OR he/she has completed 6(six) years of service in the current IDA scale, whichever is earlier.	No change proposed.	As proposed by HLC
2.	The subsequent upgradation of IDA scale to the next higher IDA scale will be due on completion of 5 (five) years of service in the current IDA scale.	No change proposed.	As proposed by HLC
3.	The service rendered by any Executive in existing IDA pay scale in BSNL will only be counted for upgradation to next higher IDA scale.	No change proposed.	As proposed by HLC
4.	The review for all Executives meeting the qualifying service conditions of Para (b) (3) above will be done every year with reference to Review date i.e. on 1 st October. On being found fit, the IDA scale upgradation will be effective from the due date.	No change proposed.	As proposed by HLC
5.	The fitness for IDA Pay scale upgradation to the next higher IDA scale of the eligible executives will be judged by prescribed Screening Committee on the basis of performance rating of ACRs, as per details given below, subject to necessary disciplinary/ vigilance clearance and no punishment is current.	No change proposed.	As proposed by HLC
6.	The ACRs of the previous 5 (five)	Bhave Committee	As proposed by

	<p>years shall be taken into consideration for arriving at marks with rating marks as below:</p> <p>Performance</p> <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Rating Marks</td> <td>Each year</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">in ACRs for</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Outstanding</td> <td>20</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Very Good</td> <td>16</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Good</td> <td>12</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Average</td> <td>08</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Below Average</td> <td>zero</td> </tr> </table> <p>Total Marks for Performance Ratings in ACRs are 100. If any executive obtains 60 marks of above (50 marks or above in case of SC/ST) out of total 100 marks allotted, he/she shall be considered fit for the IDA scale upgradation.</p> <p>Note: BSNL Board changed the total marks required for promotion from 60 to 56 (for general candidates) and from 50 to 48 (in case of SC/ST).</p>	Rating Marks	Each year	in ACRs for		Outstanding	20	Very Good	16	Good	12	Average	08	Below Average	zero	<p>proposed total marks for performance ratings in ACRs are 100. If an executive obtains 44 marks or above out of total 100 marks allotted he shall be considered fit for the IDA scale upgradation, to avoid droppings more than 4%.</p>	<p>Bhave Committee</p>
Rating Marks	Each year																
in ACRs for																	
Outstanding	20																
Very Good	16																
Good	12																
Average	08																
Below Average	zero																
<p>7.</p>	<p>For the purpose of counting the service in current IDA pay scale for any Time Bound upgradation, technical break periods in the Adhoc arrangements ordered by DoT/DTS/DTO/BSNL Corporate Office will be treated as continuous for the limited purpose of counting of current IDA scale service period only without any other benefit, monetary or otherwise. Further, IDA scale granted to any Executive by virtue of any local officiating arrangements will not count for the purpose of IDA</p>	<p>No Change proposed.</p>	<p>As proposed by HLC.</p>														

	payscale upgradation.		
8.	Review to be done at Circle level for all disciplines on a time bound basis and on being found fit as per concerned regulatory conditions, the IDA scale of Executive will be upgraded to the concerned IDA scale from due date. On being found unfit, the next review will be due on next review date and the screening committee while judging the fitness of the executive will also decide about the date of effect of upgradation of pay scale.	No change proposed.	As proposed by HLC
9.	Consequent to upgradation of IDA pay scale, there will be NO CHANGE IN SUBSTANTIVE STATUS, designation and duties and responsibilities of Executive, unless any change is ordered in specific context.	No change proposed. Matter left to BSNL for decision.	As proposed by HLC.
10.	Since the first review under Executive upgradation policy is to be made with reference to 01.10.2004, upgradation due to the Executive on or before 01.10.2004 based on earlier time bound policies, so upgradation will be granted to the executive on the basis of options as ONE TIME RELAXATION if he /she is willing for such promotion and adjudged fit in accordance with concerned regulatory conditions. Options once exercised shall be final. The subsequent eligibility for IDA pay scale upgradation of such Executives will be governed by BSNL's Time Bound Upgradation Scheme.	No change is proposed.	As proposed by HLC.
11.	With the implementation of TIME BOUND Upgradation with effect from 01.10.2004, provisions with regard to the post based or otherwise arrangements like Ad-hoc/officiating/In-situ/ACP and any time bound promotion/upgradation scheme presently in operation in BSNL shall stand	No change proposed.	As proposed by HLC.

	withdrawn, unless permitted in any specific context.		
12.	Every Executive whose pay is upgraded to next higher IDA pay scale will have to compulsorily undergo Two weeks of training (One week in Administrative Management/ Customer Care and one week in latest developments in Core Competence Area) for being eligible for drawal of second increment in the upgraded IDA Pay scale, i.e. the training is to be completed within a period of two years from the date of upgradation to the higher scale. The Executive who fails to successfully undergo the prescribed two weeks training will not be eligible for consideration for next IDA scale upgradation even if he/she is due for upgradation otherwise. The detailed instructions in his regard shall be issued by the training branch of BSNL.	No change proposed.	As proposed by HLC.
13.	Since complete picture of Executive cadre will emerge only after terms and conditions of Group A absorption are known and linked issues appropriately addressed, existing designations shall continue. However, to bring similarity in designations for Executives of same pay scales working in Corporate Office, the designations of all SDEs/Aos/PSs/Sos be changed to AD(Assistant Director) and all all JTOs/JAOs/Assistants/PAs to be changed to Joint AD.	No change proposed.	As proposed by HLC.
14.	BSNL Board decided that Management Trainees Recruitment is to be done at the level of STS. 50:25:25 will be the ratio for filling up the post through Seniority cum Fitness, Departmental Examination and Direct Recruitment.	Bhave Committee proposed for recruitment of MT at STS level with 60:20:20 for Seniority cum Fitness, Department Examination and Direct Recruitment	
15.	Period of past service rendered in	No change proposed.	As proposed by

	the DoT/DTS/DTO not to be counted for the purpose of time bound IDA upgradation (no service weightage) since financial benefit is given through point to point fixation in IDA pay scale.		HLC.
16.	Implementation of all upgrade/ revised IDA pay scales with effect from 1.10.2000. Note: It was not a part of HLC recommendation. Separate Committee was formed to recommend on this matter.	Bhave Committee left it for the decision of BSNL.	Same as the recommendations of Bhave Committee.
17.	One time placement of SDEs in the grade of Sr. SDE as on 1.10.2000. HLC did not address the issue.	Bhave Committee discussed the issue but left it to BSNL to take a decision.	As proposed by Bhave Committee.

NOTE: The CWC to be held on 14,15/10/2006 will have detailed discussion on all the above issues. Future course of action will be taken in CWC for improvement as it was agreed at the time of absorption of group "B" officers.